



CONSTITUTIONALE

Volume 3 Issue 1, January-June 2022: PP: 11-20

Faculty of Law, Universitas Lampung, Bandar Lampung, Indonesia.

<http://jurnal.fh.unila.ac.id/index.php/constitutionale>

P-ISSN: 2723-2492 E-ISSN: 2745-9322

Bureaucracy and Government

Yuliana Keke Febrianti

Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia

yuliana20002@mail.unpad.ac.id

Zahra Malinda Putri

Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia

zahra20026@mail.unpad.ac.id

Adhyatma Wikrama Maheswara

Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia

adhyatmawm@gmail.com

Submitted: Feb 15, 2022 ; Reviewed: Apr 21, 2022; Accepted: Jun 27, 2022

Article's Information

Abstract

Keywords:

Bureaucracy; Government; Public Service.

DOI:

<https://doi.org/10.25041/constitutionale.v3i1.2534>

Abstract

The purpose of this paper is that the author tries to explain the concept of bureaucracy and government. In addition, the author also describes the differences between bureaucracy and government in terms of definition, theory, and task. This paper also aims to discuss the position of the bureaucracy in the trias politica system, where there is a classification of power, namely the executive, legislative and judiciary. Then, this paper will lead to the administration and implementation of public services. The conclusion from this paper is that government and bureaucracy are two different things and bureaucracy can become an entity outside of the executive, legislative and judiciary and those in charge of providing public services are the bureaucrats, not the government. However, actually bureaucrats and government have different roles in responsibility to deliver public service.



A. Introduction

We often hear the term "government bureaucracy." The terms bureaucracy and government seem inseparable. According to the Big Indonesian Dictionary (KBBI), the word "bureaucracy" means a government system run by government employees because it has adhered to hierarchies and levels of office. Bureaucracy is an organization consisting of salaried officers who carry out detailed government tasks, provide advice and implement policy decisions.¹ Meanwhile, the government has the meaning of employees, officials, or bodies (agencies, institutions, departments, and so on) that run the wheels of government, such as village heads, sub-district heads, regents, governors, and ministers. The two definitions from the KBBI show that bureaucracy is interpreted as a system, while the government is an object. Government in a broad sense can be interpreted as a government in the legislative, judicial, and so on. In comparison, the government in a narrow sense can be interpreted as a holder of an office as the executor of executive power or the government as the organizer of state administration.²

Lpeawski (in Mustafa, 2014: 4) says that the bureaucracy is the center of the state's administration carrying out its functions and roles in modern society³. The implementation of state government in its function to serve the interests of the community, of course, varies depending on the dominant aspect of influencing. As is the case from the political, power, and bureaucratic aspects in the dynamics of government in Indonesia, there is a political tug-of-war and power has a strong influence on the shift in the function and role of the bureaucracy.⁴

Another definition is according to the Merriam-Webster Dictionary, bureaucracy is defined as "a body of nonelected government officials" or "government characterized by specialization of functions, adherence to fixed rules, and a hierarchy of authority." While the government is defined as "the organization, machinery, or agency through which a political unit exercises authority and performs functions and which is usually classified according to the distribution of power within it" or "the complex of political institutions, laws, and customs through which the function of governing is carried out." From these two definitions, the difference between bureaucracy and government can be seen when bureaucracy is characterized by a government system with specialized functions, adherence to fixed rules, and a hierarchy of authority. In contrast, the government is an organization or institution in which political units exercise authority and perform government functions. Carl Heinzen offers a seemingly neutral technical definition of bureaucracy as an administrative structure in which a single official controls the administration as opposed to a collegial structure in which several officials work under the leadership of a chief but have the right to participate in collective administration.⁵

¹ Nurdewi, "Adaptasi Manajemen ASN di Maluku Utara Menuju Birokrasi Berkelas Dunia", *Sentri: Jurnal Riset Ilmiah* Vol.1, No.2 Oktober 2022 : 353.

² Dudung Abdullah, "Hubungan Pemerintah Pusat Dengan Pemerintah Daerah", *Jurnal Hukum POSITUM* Vol. 1, No. 1, Desember 2016 : 85

³ Rika Ramadhan, "Politik Dan Birokrasi Pemerintahan", Riau, *Jurnal Trias Politika* Vol 2. No.1:96-104,

⁴ Ajib Rakhmawanto, "Politization Analysis Of Bureaucracy In Developing State Civil Services" Jakarta Timur, *Jurnal Civil Servis*. VOL. 14, No.2, November 2020 : 1 - 10 2

⁵ Suyudi, Peran Birokrasi Bagi Suatu Organisasi, *Jurnal Media Aplikom*, Vol. 2, No. 2, Mei 2012 : 35.

The existence of various definitions of bureaucracy and government and the repeated use of the phrase “government bureaucracy” creates confusion over the similarities or differences between bureaucracy and government. The concept of trias politica put forward by Montesquieu which is applied in Indonesia, where the system of state power is divided into three namely executive, legislative, and judicial also raises questions about the position of the bureaucracy in the concept. As a result, the party in charge of providing public services is also questioned. Therefore, it is essential to learn and discuss more bureaucracy and government.

Based on this background, the author tries to analyze the bureaucratic system in government. The author examines the political system and public service administration. This research is expected to contribute to an independent political system. The novelty of this research will significantly contribute to determining suggestions, functions and responsibilities in the political system of bureaucracy and government. Several problems such as to what extent is the difference between bureaucracy and government? What are the similarities between bureaucracy and government? Where is the position of the bureaucracy in the system of state power (trias politica)? And who is the party responsible for providing public service?

B. Discussion

The issue of bureaucracy and government is a complex matter where everyone has their perspective to explain or define them. In fact, most people define and view bureaucracy as a bad thing where there is a slow way of working because of the extended communication chain.

The famous bureaucracy theory is the bureaucracy theory of Max Weber. Max Weber's writings define bureaucracy as an "ideal type," which has become the basis for much of the scientific literature on bureaucracy.⁶ He also put forward the six principles of bureaucracy.⁷ First, Task Specialization where tasks are divided into simple and routine categories based on competence and functional specialization. Each employee is responsible for what they do best and knows exactly what is expected of him. Second is Hierarchical Authority, where managers are organized into hierarchical layers, and each management layer is responsible for staff and overall performance. Next is the Formal Selection, where all employees are selected based on technical skills and competencies, which have been obtained through training, education and experience. Then, Rules and Requirements where formal rules and requirements are needed to ensure uniformity so that employees know exactly what is expected of them. Fifth is Impersonal, where clear rules and requirements create distant and impersonal relationships between employees, with the advantage of preventing nepotism or involvement from outsiders or politics. Lastly, there is Career Orientation, where employees are selected based on their expertise. This helps in placing the right people in the correct positions and thus making optimal use of human resources.

Not only Max Weber but several experts also revealed several definitions of bureaucracy. In the book "Rekonstruksi Birokrasi Pemerintahan Daerah,"⁸ the definition of bureaucracy, according to Peter M. Blau and W. Meyer, is a type of organization intended to achieve administrative tasks by systematically coordinating the work of many members of the organization. Then according to Rourke, bureaucracy is an administrative system and the implementation of daily tasks that are structured, in a transparent hierarchical system, carried out in writing, by certain sections separate from other sections, by people who are chosen because of their abilities and expertise in their fields.

⁶ William A. Niskanen, Jr, *Bureaucracy & Representative Government*, Chicago: Aldine, (2007), p. 21

⁷ Rajender Kumar, "Bureaucratic Theory by Max Weber – A Review Study," *Journal of Advances and Scholarly Researches in Allied Education (JASRAE)* Vol. VII No. 23 (2016): 213-214

⁸ Irfan Setiawan, *Rekonstruksi Birokrasi Pemerintahan Daerah*, Bandung: Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri, (2014), p.2

All the previously mentioned definitions refer to bureaucracy as a system of running the government in an orderly and coordinated manner to effectively and efficiently achieve specific goals. In contrast to the notion of government, according to Bayu Surianingrat⁹, the government is an institution with the authority to govern administrative areas. Then according to Adam and Jessica, the government is an organization or institution that has the authority to exercise or exercise power according to the applicable rules and regulations.¹⁰ In a broad sense, according to Salam, the government is all activities and functions of state administration carried out by the legislature, and executive, in achieving state goals.¹¹

Based on these various definitions of government, it can be seen that government is an organization or institution with power. From the theory and various definitions of bureaucracy and government, it can be seen that bureaucracy and government are not the same. Bureaucracy refers more to a system running the government, while government refers to an organization or institution with power. In other words, it can be said that bureaucracy is a system that works behind power and authority.

When viewed from the side of taking office and looking at the definition of government in a narrow sense, namely the government is the executive, it is clear that bureaucracy and government are different. The government or the executive can occupy their positions by being directly elected by the people through elections. Meanwhile, bureaucracy is a government apparatus appointed and not elected through elections by representative institutions.¹² According to the Merriam-Webster Dictionary, bureaucracy is "a body of nonelected government officials," which means that bureaucracy is a body of unelected government officials.

Bureaucracy and government also have different tasks. The government has three leading roles or tasks, according to Adam Smith. "Adam Smith's Roles for Government and Contemporary U.S Government Roles" states, "Smith believed that government's proper roles in society should be limited, but well defined: government should provide national defense, the administration of justice, and public goods." This statement shows that the three government roles in society are to provide national defense, justice, and public goods. Meanwhile, the bureaucracy has four tasks¹³, and the first is Administrative Tasks. It is the main task of the bureaucracy to implement the laws and policies set by the organization. This means the bureaucracy must perform the administrative function to manage all organizational affairs. The second is the task of providing policy advice. In this case, the bureaucracy serves as the central organization in the state. It has the function of providing information and advice or suggestions for the organization in taking a policy. Next is the Articulation and Aggregation of Interests Tasks. The bureaucracy is often involved in articulation and aggregation functions regularly because it implements organizational policies and programs. The bureaucracy must relate to various community groups related tasks such as teachers, doctors, entrepreneurs, etc. The last is the Task of Maintaining Organizational Stability. Rulers, ministers, constitutions, laws, political parties, and models of government may change millions of times at any time. Still, the bureaucracy is obliged to keep the state alive and integrated, and state mechanisms in which it continues to run well from time to time.

⁹ Muhtar Haboddin, *Pengantar Ilmu Pemerintahan*, Malang: UB Press, (2015), p.3

¹⁰ *ibid*

¹¹ Dharma Setyawan Salam, *Manajemen Pemerintahan Indonesia*, Jakarta: Djambatan (2004), p.36

¹² *ibid*, p.2

¹³ Zainuddin Mustapa, *Bunga Rampai Birokrasi (Isu-Isu Strategik Seputar Birokrasi)*, Makasar: Celebes Media Perkasa (2017), p.5-6

From the explanation of the roles and duties above, it can be seen clearly that government and bureaucracy are two different things. People's thoughts or understanding of the similarities between government and bureaucracy can be caused by the unclear role of the executive, who holds two positions: head of state and head of government. In the journal entitled "Hubungan Pemerintah dan Birokrasi"¹⁴ it is stated that in practice, there is often confusion between the President as head of state and head of government. The executive role played by the President is often addressed to the head of state and vice versa. This unclear role has resulted in a bureaucracy that should have become a state institution, then becomes a government institution. Although it was mentioned earlier that the bureaucracy is a system that works behind the power and authority of the government, it does not mean that the bureaucracy works for the government. If we look again at the definition of bureaucracy according to the Merriam-Webster Dictionary, where bureaucracy is defined as "a body of nonelected government officials," practically, bureaucracy can also be called a government because bureaucracy is a government official who is not elected (by the people). The definition of bureaucracy in the book "The Bureaucracy: The Real Government"¹⁵ also states that "A bureaucrat is someone who works in an administrative capacity for the government." From these two definitions, it can be understood that the government is divided into two: the government that is not elected and the government that is elected. The government that is not elected is called a bureaucrat. While the elected government is called the executive or in Indonesia in the personnel system, it is better known as political and career positions.

Political position can be interpreted as an official who is the winner of the general election results, which includes a political process. The government included in this political position is stated in Article 11 of Undang- leadership positions, further divided into more specific positions.

In its ideal form, the bureaucracy is a servant of the state and not a servant of the government.¹⁶ Thus, the bureaucracy *Undang Nomor 43 Tahun 1999 Tentang Perubahan Atas Undang-Undang No 08 Tahun 1974 Tentang Pokok-Pokok Kepegawaian* (Law No. 43/1999 on Amendments to Law No. 08/1974 on the Basics of Employee), which including the President and Vice President, DPR, Governor and Deputy Governor, Regent/Mayor and Deputy Regent/Deputy Mayor, and so on.

Career positions normatively implement policies that originate or are made by political officials or people who occupy political positions. The government, which includes career positions, is regulated in Article 13, Article 14, and Article 19 of *Undang-Undang No Lima Tahun 2014 tentang Aparatur Sipil Negara* (Law No. 5 of 2014 on State Civil Apparatus). The law states that the positions of the State Civil Apparatus consist of administrative positions, available positions, and high. The government is not a single entity, but the bureaucracy is a separate entity.

The bureaucracy as its entity outside the framework of the trias politica is further explained by Kartawijaya¹⁷. According to her, if the government is understood as a political office, then there is confusion in the position of the bureaucracy in the trias politica structure because of the unification of government agencies and state administration (bureaucracy), such as the existence of a state civil apparatus that carries out state administration duties in the legislative

¹⁴ Ali Abdul Wakhid, "Hubungan Pemerintah dan Birokrasi", Lampung, Jurnal Teropong Aspirasi Politik Islam (Jurnal TAPIs) Vol 8 No 2, (2012): 164

¹⁵ Ushistory.org, *The Bureaucracy : The real Government*, Tuesday 22 September 2020, Philadelphia, American Government Online Textbook, <https://www.ushistory.org/gov/8.asp>

¹⁶ Pipit R. Kartawijaya dalam Ali Abdul Wakhid, "Hubungan Pemerintah dan Birokrasi", Lampung, Jurnal Teropong Aspirasi Politik Islam (Jurnal TAPIs), Vol 8 No 2, (2012): 165

¹⁷ Ali Abdul Wakhid, Op. Cit 164-165

body. Furthermore, according to him, the bureaucracy (state administration) in a negative formulation, is "all kinds of state activities that are not legislative, not judicial, and not the government (executive)."

The Spanish state also proves bureaucracy as an entity itself. In the article "Government and Bureaucracy"¹⁸ written by the Center of Research for Development (CIDAC), Mexico City, it is stated that Spain was once in a state without a government because Spanish politicians had not reached an agreement to form a coalition government (which required holding new elections) for several months, but the economy is improving every day and the country is functioning normally. Furthermore, the article states that one measure of development is the quality of the government, but what happens is that the bureaucracy makes the government function run well from day to day, regardless of the political-legislative decision-making process. In fact, it is said that "Spain is similar to any of the developed countries that function independently of the individual -person or party- who governs," which means Spain is similar to one of the developed countries that function independently of the governing individual or party.

The separation between government and bureaucracy is also fundamental. It was conveyed to Rubio¹⁹ that the difference between government and bureaucracy allows a country to maintain stability and function commonly independently of political disputes. The difference in responsibilities between the government and the bureaucracy is also shown in European and American countries, where the government sets goals, criteria and regulations, and the bureaucracy is responsible for implementing these regulations in a professional and non-partisan manner.

From what happened in Spain, it can be seen that the bureaucracy can continue to run well even though the government is not in a stable condition. The bureaucracy can continue to make government functions run well without being influenced by political and legislative decisions. Thus, the bureaucracy can become an entity outside the executive, legislature, and judiciary. Even the bureaucracy has a massive role in maintaining the country's stability because if the bureaucracy does not work correctly, it will impact the government system as a whole. In other words, the bureaucracy has its power and role in running the government and must be separated from the executive, legislative and judicial branches.

After separating the bureaucracy and the government, we need to know who is responsible for public services. In Article 1 of Law No. 5 of 2014 on State Civil Apparatus, it is stated that public service implementers, in the future referred to as Implementers, are officials, employees, officers, and everyone who works in the organizing organization in charge of carrying out an action or series of public service actions. From that, it can be seen that the implementers of public services are employees. The employees in question are State Civil Apparatus Employees (ASN Employees). This is stated in Article 11 of Law No. 5 of 2014 on State Civil Apparatus that ASN employees are duty to provide professional and quality public services. From this it can be seen that the implementers of public services or those in charge of providing public services are ASN employees or bureaucrats.

Furthermore, the government also plays a role in carrying out public services. In Article 6 of *Undang-Undang Nomor 25 Tahun 2009 tentang Pelayanan Publik* (Law Number 25 of 2009 on Public Services), it is also stated that the leader of state institutions such as heads of ministries, leaders of non-ministerial government institutions, heads of state commission institutions, and leaders of other institutions such as governor at the provincial level, and the mayor at the city level acts as a public service coach to ensure the smooth implementation of

¹⁸ Luis Rubio (President of Centre of Research for Development (CIDAC), Mexico City), Government and Bureaucracy, 2016, http://trilateral.org/download/files/News/RUBIO_GOVERNMENT_AND_BUREAUCRACY.pdf

¹⁹ ibid

public services. Thus, in the context of the function of public services, the bureaucracy and the government have different roles. The bureaucracy plays a direct role in the implementation of public services, while the government plays a role in supervising and ensuring the smooth implementation of public service.

C. Conclusion

Based on the explanation above, it can be concluded that bureaucracy and government are two different things. Second, the bureaucracy and the government are included in the government system. Still, a bureaucracy is a government that the people do not elect and the government is an elected government which results in different tasks and functions. Then, the bureaucracy can become an entity outside the state power system (*trias politica*). Finally, the bureaucracy and the government have responsibilities in the delivery of public services with different roles.

Bibliography

A. Book

- Dharma Setyawan Salam, *Manajemen Pemerintahan Indonesia*, Jakarta: Djambatan. 2004.
- Haboddin, M. *Pengantar Ilmu Pemerintahan*. Malang : UB Press, 2015 Jr, W. A, *Bureaucracy & Representative Government*. Chicago: Aldine, 2007.
- Irfan Setiawan, *Rekonstruksi Birokrasi Pemerintahan Daerah* , Bandung: Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri, 2014.
- Muhtar Haboddin, *Pengantar Ilmu Pemerintahan*, Malang: UB Press. 2015.
- Mustapa, Z., *Bunga Rampai Birokrasi (Isu-Isu Startejik Seputar Birokrasi)*. Makasar: Celebes Media Perkasa, 2017.
- Salam, D.S, *Manajemen Pemerintahan Indonesia*. Jakarta: Djambatan, 2004.
- Setiawan, I, *Rekontruksi Birokrasi Pemerintahan Daerah*. Bandung: Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri, 2014.
- William A. Niskanen. Jr, *Bureaucracy & Representative Government*, Chicago: Aldine, 2007.
- Zainuddin Mustapa, *Bunga Rampai Birokrasi (Isu-Isu Stratejik Seputar Birokrasi)*, Makasar:Celebes Media Perkasa (2017)

B. Journal

- Ahmad, B. “Kondisi Birokrasi di Indonesia dalam Hubungannya dengan Pelayanan Publik”. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik* 4, no. 1, 2008 : 45-62.
- Ajib Rakhmawanto, ”Politicization Analysis Of Bureaucracy In Developing State Civil Services” Jakarta Timur, *Jurnal Civil Service* 14, no. 2, November 2020 : 1 – 102.
- Ali Abdul Wakhid, “Hubungan Pemerintah dan Birokrasi”, Lampung, *Jurnal Teropong Aspirasi Politik Islam*”. *Jurnal TAPIS*) 8, no. 2, 2012 : 155- 176.
<https://doi.org/10.24042/tps.v8i2.1570>

- Edi Kusmayadi & Taufiq Nurrohman, “Reformasi Birokrasi di Tingkat Desa (Studi Komparasi Pelaksanaan Reformasi Birokrasi dan Pelayanan Publik di Desa Sukakarta dan Desa Setiawangsi Kecamatan Jatiwaras Kabupaten Tasikmalaya)”, *Aliansi* 3, no. 2, Juli 2011 : 437-452.
- Dudung Abdullah, “Hubungan Pemerintah Pusat Dengan Pemerintah Daerah”, *Jurnal Hukum POSITUM* 1, no. 1, Desember 2016 : 83-103.
- Jody W. Lipford dan Jerry Slice, “Adam Smith’s Roles for Government and Contemporary U.S Government Roles – Is The Welfare State Crowding Out Government’s Basic Functions?”, *Virginia, The Independent Review Journal* Vol.XI No 4, 2007 : 486.
- Kumar, R, “Bureaucratic Theory by Max Weber – A Review Study” *Journal of Advances and Scholarly Researches in Allied Education (JASRAE)* Vol. VII No. 23, 2016 : 213-214
- Lipford, J. W., & Slice, J, “Adam Smith’s Roles for Government and Contemporary U.S Government Roles – Is The Welfare State Crowding Out Government’s Basic Functions?” *The Independent Review Journal* Vol.XI No 4, 2007: 486.
- Mai Damai Ria, “Analisis Pengaruh Reformasi Birokrasi Terhadap Kinerja Pemerintah Daerah: Study kasus di Pemerintahan Jawa Barat”, *Civil Service* 10, no. 1, Juni 2016 : 51-68.
- Nurdewi, “Adaptasi Manajemen ASN Di Maluku Utara Menuju Birokrasi Berkelas Dunia”, *Sentri: Jurnal Riset Ilmiah* 1, no. 2 Oktober 2022 : 349-356. <https://doi.org/10.55681/sentri.v1i2.239>.
- Pipit R. Kartawijaya dalam Ali Abdul Wakhid, “Hubungan Pemerintah dan Birokrasi”, Lampung, *Jurnal Teropong Aspirasi Politik Islam*. *Jurnal TAPIS* 8, no. 2, (2012): 155-176. <https://doi.org/10.24042/tps.v8i2.1570>
- Rajender Kumar, “Bureaucratic Theory by Max Weber – A Review Study,” *Journal of Advances and Scholarly Researches in Allied Education (JASRAE)* Vol. VII No. 23 (2016): 213-214.
- Rika Ramadhan, “Politik Dan Birokrasi Pemerintahan”, Riau, *Jurnal Trias Politika* 2, no.1 2018 : 96-114. <https://doi.org/10.33373/jtp.v2i1.1242>.
- Suyudi, “Peran Birokrasi Bagi Suatu Organisasi”, *Jurnal Media Aplikom* 2, no. 2, Mei 2012 : 34-39. <https://doi.org/10.33488/1.ma.2012.2.88>
- Wakhid, A. A, “Hubungan Pemerintah dan Birokrasi” *Jurnal Teropong Aspirasi Politik Islam (Jurnal TAPIS)* 8, no 2, 2012 :155176. <https://doi.org/10.24042/tps.v8i2.1570>.

C. Regulation

Undang-Undang Nomor 25 Tahun 2009 Tentang Pelayanan Publik

Undang-Undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2014 Tentang Aparatur Sipil Negara

Undang-Undang No 43 Tahun 1999 Tentang Perubahan atas Undang-Undang No 08 tahun 1974 tentang Pokok-Pokok Kepegawaian

D. Internet

<http://cidac.org/eng/government-and-bureaucracy/>, accessed on 25 January 2021

<https://www.ushistory.org/gov/8.asp>, accessed on 25 January 2021

Ushistory.org, *The Bureaucracy : The real Government*, Tuesday 22 September 2020,
Philadelphia, American Government Online Textbook,
<https://www.ushistory.org/gov/8.asp>

